

# Appendix 6: Independent Design Review

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, LANDS AND HERITAGE	
DATE	FILE
29-Oct-2020	SDAU-004-20



ARCHITECTURE  
INTERIORS  
URBAN DESIGN  
PLANNING  
LANDSCAPE

ADELAIDE MELBOURNE  
BRISBANE PERTH  
DARWIN SYDNEY

Level 2, 50 Subiaco Square  
Subiaco, Western Australia 6008

PO Box 416  
Subiaco WA 6904 Australia

T +61 8 9381 0200  
F +61 8 9382 4224

E [wa@hamessharley.com.au](mailto:wa@hamessharley.com.au)  
W [www.hamessharley.com.au](http://www.hamessharley.com.au)

HAMES  
SHARLEY



## Melvista – Design Review

08 June 2020

Edward Neville Director  
Total Project management.  
Level 6 1008 Hay St  
Perth Western Australia 6000

## Design Review Report

Project: Melvista, Nedlands – 4 Storey Aged Care Development

---

Subject: Design Review May & June 2020.

---

Review by: Chris Maher Architect

---

## INTRODUCTION

Following a meetings In May and June to review preliminary plans of the Oryx/ Hassell proposed aged care development at 18-19 Doonan Rd and 10-11 Betty St Nedlands, revised plans prepared by HASSELL were again provided to me for further review and comment prior to their lodgement with the city of Nedlands in early June.

Revised plans Include:

- The Melvista Nedlands, Architectural Design Statement prepared by Hassell dated, June 2020.
- The Melvista Nedlands, Architectural Drawings prepared Hassell as listed below;
  - SK-0010 – Site Survey Precinct – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0011 – Site Survey – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0012 – Site – Context – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0013 – Site – Tress – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0014 – Site – Setbacks – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0015 – Site Plan – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0020 – GA Plan – Basement – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0021 – GA Plan – Level 00 – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0022 – GA Plan – Level 01 – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0023 – GA Plan – Level 02 – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0024 – GA Plan – Level 03 – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0025 – GA Plan – Roof – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0030 – Short Section – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0031 – Long Section – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0040 – Street Context Elevations – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0041 – North & East Elevations – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0042 - South & West Elevations – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0050 - Boundary Elevations – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0052 – DA – Pot Ratio – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0053 – DA – Aerial View – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0055 – Doonan Road View – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0056 – Betty Street View Facing North – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0070 – DA Sun Study 1 – Rev A, 8 June 2020
  - SK-0071 - DA Sun Study 2 – Rev A, 8 June 2020

I undertook an independent Peer Review of the above amended plans and additional Information and provided the comments within this report.

COMMENTS FROM CHRIS MAHER

Principle	Initial Design Review feedback	Comments on revised DA plans
<u>General</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The proposal generally appeared to provide a positive response to the context of this part of Nedlands and was heading in the right direction.</li> <li>It was noted that although well detailed, the proposal was at a relatively early stage of design. Further detailed layouts and design resolution would therefore follow in response to my and Oryx/Hassell's own Design Review.</li> </ul>	<p>The proponent and consultants are commended on the changes made, in particular in relation to the ground floor layout, roof line, and top floor sectional treatment.</p>
<u>Context and Character</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The design intent to break the bulk of the main two street elevations into two key building elements so as to better reflect the traditional scale and character of built form in this location is very relevant and positive.</li> <li>The site analysis context report, including building elevations, sections and 3D modelling was very helpful in explaining how the future building would sit within its context. This report also demonstrated how the design had been influenced by a good understanding of the local context.</li> </ul>	<p>This was carefully considered in the earlier documents and importantly the applicant has demonstrated the influence and decision making made as a result of this context and character study.</p>
<u>Landscape Quality</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The proposed planting should consider the existing street context and maintain the quality and character of the frontage to the adjacent streets.</li> <li>The Initial design demonstrated good understanding of the amenity required to both adjacent streets and the amenity to be afforded to the residents within the aged care facility.</li> <li>The design may benefit from the softening of the edges of the vehicle ramp by including edge planting to the base of the southern retaining wall.</li> <li>The extension of the deep soil zone towards the South Western corner of the site would work well with a revised entrance if this moves further south.</li> </ul>	<p>The large trees proposed are well positioned to ensure maximum benefit to the surrounding residents and future residents of the facility.</p> <p>The design now incorporates a steel edge planter (400mm deep) to accommodate climbers along the southern wall of the vehicle ramp.</p> <p>The quality and overall character of the street verge and landscape of Doonan Rd and Betty St will be maintained by the landscape proposed.</p> <p>Deep soil calculations have been provided.</p>
<u>Built Form and Scale</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The building appears to be well modulated vertically and horizontally, with good articulation.</li> <li>The building height rises to 4 stories however the general appearance of the building will be of a 3-storey building from within the adjacent Betty St and Doonan Rd given the set-backs in particular significant setback of the fourth level on the east and west elevations.</li> <li>Further articulation of the top-level roof form together with verge and soffits of lower levels should be considered.</li> </ul>	<p>The built form is well aligned with the scheme and responds well to the scale and rhythm of the residential houses within the east and west flanking streets.</p> <p>Further work has been undertaken on the articulation of the upper roof and the lower level soffits of roof overhangs. This has resulted in a successful outcome. The roof maintains cohesion but is articulated appropriately.</p> <p>Louvers located within the upper balcony soffits and the upper roof also give further access to natural light and provide detail and articulation to the roof forms.</p> <p>Importantly the roof plant, lift over-run and services will all be screened from public view.</p>

<p><u>Functionality and Build Quality</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The ground floor entry and associated reception could be simplified and re-located further south to provide more visual links and legibility regarding the internal circulation.</li> <li>The lounge and common spaces behind reception running along the southern side of the plan behind reception could be consolidated.</li> <li>The positioning of a main entry off Doonan Rd and secondary entry off Betty St is logical and clear and activates both of these streets.</li> <li>The location of the entry driveway on the lower southern boundary helps to reduce the impact of the driveway ramp and reduce the gradient and change of level.</li> <li>Rubbish truck collection movements would need to be to the satisfaction of the Council.</li> </ul>	<p>The Ground floor appears more logical and will provide a more appropriate and activated street front.</p> <p>This consolidation has occurred, and the ground floor entries and general arrangement is made more legible and logical with improved amenity.</p> <p>The positioning of resident entries to the two fronted streets echoes the activation of the residential entries to many of the existing houses within these streets.</p> <p>The location of the vehicle driveway, inclusion of a single basement and a roof trench have enabled services and parking to be screened from view resulting in an efficient, functional and aesthetically successful outcome.</p> <p>The rubbish collection will be entirely within the site and screened from view.</p>
<p><u>Sustainability</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sustainability initiatives need to be clear and need to be highlighted within the design.</li> <li>Access to natural light has carefully been considered in the location of each of the resident rooms in particular to minimise the number of rooms with a southerly orientation.</li> </ul>	<p>The sustainability initiatives have been listed.</p> <p>Not requiring a transfer slab and an efficient building structure will reduce the need for additional concrete and steel and this is supported.</p> <p>Visual and physical access to greenery is provided for residents.</p> <p>Passive initiatives include natural light and ventilation into internal corridors and stairwells reducing the need for artificial light and mechanical ventilation. Good access to natural light into all common areas.</p> <p>Items for further consideration provision for charging of electric vehicles and bicycles.</p>
<p><u>Amenity</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As described earlier natural light is designed into many of the common areas. Given that the top floor lounge and terrace area correctly face the park view but are orientated south a revision with increased ceiling height and additional louvres and a 'north light' will, if included allow additional northern light to these important spaces.</li> <li>Many resident common areas are provided on each level. These are of a variety of sizes and accommodate larger groups and more intimate meetings and activities all with good access to natural light.</li> <li>A variety of room types and room orientations are provided at different levels within the facility.</li> <li>Amenity to neighbours to the south and to the north is maintained with window treatments and increased set-backs to maintain visual privacy.</li> </ul>	<p>Changes made to upper level common areas look good and will provide additional amenity.</p> <p>The inclusion of a wellness centre on the ground floor which provides services for residents and the local community is very much supported.</p>

<u>Legibility</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The building articulation &amp; form reinforces the legibility of the building and the entrances located on Betty St and Doonan Rd provide clear visible entry points.</li> </ul>	Changes made to the Ground floor frontage and main entrance on Doonan Rd have improved legibility which is clear and well considered both externally and internally for visitors and residents.
<u>Safety</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The overlooking of the two fronted streets both from entries, reception, common areas, the resident rooms and wellness centre will add to the passive safety of these existing streets during the day and also in the evening.</li> <li>The Inclusion of a low garden gate to the Betty St entry will clearly define the public space boundary.</li> <li>The vehicle driveway will be overlooked by windows from the ground floor common areas as well as the reception, wellness centre and resident rooms above.</li> </ul>	<p>The inclusion of the garden gate off Betty St assists in establishing the facility boundary while maintaining a safe residential interface with Betty St.</p> <p>Generally CPTED principles appear to have been well considered and adopted.</p>
<u>Community</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The building appears to address setbacks in a way that provides good separation from adjacent uses and minimise inappropriate over-looking.</li> <li>Overshadowing does not appear to be significant and was not raised as an issue.</li> </ul>	Setbacks are generally above those required, and the proposed building sits within the allowable building envelope.
<u>Aesthetics</u>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It was recommended that soffits be treated with good quality materials given their exposure to the street.</li> <li>Materiality is consistent with the type of materials and their current use and application within this part of Nedlands.</li> <li>The fenestration to the northern elevation should be further articulated and less modular and rigerouse.</li> </ul>	<p>The building aesthetics are well resolved for DA stage and the elevational composition is well articulated and further defined by the proposed use of materials such as brickwork metal and painted concrete.</p> <p>The northern elevation has been more carefully composed and a less institutional approach adopted resulting in a much more successful outcome.</p>

## CONCLUSION

I believe the revised plans have evolved to produce a considered and appropriate design outcome which will work well within the social, economic and environmental context of its location. Any observations and comments initially expressed during the design reviews have generally been addressed. In particular those related to the Ground Floor reception and lounge facilities, the roof form externally and Internally, fenestration, soffits and the greening of the vehicle ramp walls, Improving key areas of functionality are acknowledged.

Overall, I believe the proposal can be supported in relation to satisfying the intent of STATE PLANNING POLICY 7.0 DESIGN OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT SCHEDULE 1 – DESIGN PRINCIPLES.

Yours sincerely,



Chris Maher  
Hames Sharley Director and National Urban Development Portfolio Lead