

Appendix 12: Heritage Impact Statement

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, LANDS AND HERITAGE	
DATE	FILE
08-Dec-2020	SDAU-010-20



Mixed Use Development

120 Marine Parade, Cottesloe

Development of a Site in the
Viewshed of a Heritage Place.

Heritage Impact Statement

Prepared for:
Dempsey Developments

November 2020

Griffiths Architects



Griffiths Architects



ABN 91 277 671 706

1/315 Rokeby Road, Subiaco

Western Australia 6008

Telephone 08 9381 1666

Facsimile 08 9381 1566

mail@griffithsarchitects.com.au

www.griffithsarchitects.com.au

Griffiths Architects is a leading architectural firm in Perth, Australia. Griffiths Architects was born out of a practice of which Philip Griffiths was a co-director for over 20 years.

The company emerged from a desire to diversify the range of work covered by the practice, and to take a fresh approach to design.

The practice undertakes commissions in architecture, heritage, urban, interior design, interpretation and heritage assessments. Griffiths Architects provides professional advice on a range of issues related to these areas of our discipline.

The practice has won architectural, planning, and heritage awards for a wide range of projects located throughout the state.

Griffiths Architects has a great depth of experience across numerous project types and delivers innovative solutions that embrace environmental responsibility with elegant and simple solutions. The projects are the product of working closely with clients, carefully assessing their expectations, and delivering high quality results.

Cover: Development render from Marine Parade. Courtesy Klopper Davis Architects 2020.

.....
Date of this revision: 17 November 2020

Document	Version	Author	Status	Date
HIS	01	Griffiths Architects	Draft	11/11/2020	Dempsey Developments
HIS	02	Griffiths Architects	Draft	16/11/2020	Dempsey Developments
HIS	02	Griffiths Architects	Final	17/11/2020	Dempsey Developments



Contents

Introduction	2
Summary	2
Location	3
Heritage Listings	3
Background	4
Statement of Significance	5
Conservation Policy	6
Proposals	6
Impacts and Mitigation	10
Conclusion	12
References	13
Photographs	14



Introduction

This Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) relates to a mixed use development at 120 Marine Parade, Cottesloe. The current improvements on the land have no heritage value and neither do the adjacent developments so that this report is not directed at heritage impacts on Marine Parade.

However, on the land approximately 180m to the east of the development site, at 109 Broome Street, lies *Cottesloe Civic Centre* (Overton Lodge; Cottesloe War Memorial, Town Hall & Civic Centre) (Heritage Place No 0593), one of Cottesloe's many important heritage places.

Although not directly impacting on *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, the proposed development lies within a viewshed of the registered place. The walled and terraced gardens are amongst its highest heritage values and an important part of the visual amenity the place offers.

Heritage advice was sought from Griffiths Architects, a site assessment made and further drawn information prepared to illustrate the impact of the development on *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, views to the place and viewsheds from it.

Summary

As this impact statement and the accompanying diagrams demonstrate, it can be concluded that the development proposal has no adverse material impact on *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, or on its State heritage values.

In relation to Local List heritage values, the land west of the terraces has been subdivided and a variety of buildings have been realised, many of which have impeded a full ocean view. Landscaping of the lower terrace has also reduced ocean views. A number of ocean views will always be protected by virtue of the road reserves so that a number of significant ocean views will be retained permanently. As the study views demonstrate, views from a number of vantage points are not impacted, and at the northern end of the terraces, the impact is marginal

The assessment of the development should not turn on heritage matters.



Location

The development is located at 120 Marine Parade and the *Cottesloe Civic Centre* is to the east. Prior to its purchase by the Town of Cottesloe, the then Overton Lodge grounds extended to Marine Parade and were subsequently subdivided.



Figure 01: Aerial photograph of location. *Nearmap 2020.*

Heritage Listings

Heritage listings concerning *Cottesloe Civic Centre* include the following:

- State Register Heritage Place 0593 Permanent Entry March 1997
- Town of Cottesloe MHI Category 1 September 1995



Background

Historic Context

The historic background is based on the heritage assessment text from the State Heritage Office inHerit website.

In its first form in 1899, the place was a substantial demonstration of the way of life of one of the State's leading politicians. Under the ownership of de Bernales in the Inter-War period, the place became a demonstration of the way of life of a wealthy and flamboyant mining speculator and became a large scale symbol of his success and wealth.

The place has important associations with a number of eminent persons, including its first owner, the Hon. Mr Justice Pennefather, its second owner, Claude Albo de Bernales, Laurence Gadsdon, the Mayor of Cottesloe who oversaw the purchase of the place by the Town, architects Sir Bernard Evans, Samuel Rosenthal, Harold Boas and John Oldham, and several generations of Cottesloe councillors.

The transformation of Pennefather's original Federation Queen Anne style house, by then known as 'Overton Lodge', into an Inter-War Spanish Mission styled mansion, on a grand scale and to elegant effect, reflected a shift in popular domestic taste.

The original landholding extended to Marine Parade and remained largely undeveloped until after its acquisition by the Town of Cottesloe in 1951.

A conservation plan was prepared for the place in 1996 by Considine and Griffiths Architects, with Erickson and Taylor historians.

No research has been conducted on the history of the land that is the subject the development application as the existing development has no cultural heritage value.

Development at 120 Marine Parade

The 1953 sewer plan, drawing not long after the Cottesloe council's acquisition of the *Cottesloe Civic Centre* shows the subject lot as being sewered but undeveloped, with lots drawn up and only one house in front of the *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, half way along Overton Gardens. By 1961, the present building appears in aerial photography.

Physical Evidence

The existing building on the subject site comprises a single floor of commercial space and then two floors of flats. The building has no architectural merit or historic importance.



Statement of Significance

To assist in assessing heritage impacts, the significance of *Cottesloe Civic Centre* needs to be understood and this is summarised in the statement of significance.

The statement of significance is taken from the State Register Document, permanent entry 9 May 1997.

Cottesloe Civic Centre, a substantial two-storey, Inter-War Spanish Mission style house of rendered stone, brick and concrete with a tiled roof, a single-storey brick and tile hall, a single-storey brick and tile dwelling and substantial walled gardens, has cultural heritage significance for the following reasons:

the place has great importance to the broad community for its aesthetic characteristics as a well composed set of places in a grand, walled, garden setting and for the aesthetically pleasing character of the whole experience;

the place contributes significantly to Cottesloe due to its strategic location and landmark qualities which make a significant contribution to the townscape of Cottesloe and as a significant component of an important precinct containing several other important heritage places;

the place has importance for its associations with a past lifestyle and its very strong association with its most important and charismatic owner, Claude de Bernales, as a symbol of the second mining boom which saved Western Australia from the severest hardships of the Great Depression when his mines employed a significant number of people. Its associations with the Hon. Mr Justice Pennefather; Laurence Gadsdon, the Mayor of Cottesloe; architects Sir Bernard Evans, Samuel Rosenthal, Harold Boas and John Oldham; and several generations of the Cottesloe Councillors are also of importance;

the buildings and grounds demonstrate artistic achievement manifest in the principal characteristics of the Inter-War Spanish Mission style of architecture, with vestiges of the earlier concepts by Pennefather, where the overall aesthetic impact is considerably more important than the sum of the individual components;

the place has a high degree of social value and, since its adaptation in 1950 to a civic centre, has continued to fulfil an important social role in the local and State community;

the place is a strong presence in the context of Cottesloe and contributes significantly to the community's sense of continuity and place;

the place is representative of the Inter-War Spanish Mission style and is important in Western Australia for its large-scale use of the style and its comparative scarcity; and,

the place is representative of a large-scale culturally modified landscape of a type and order that is unusual in Western Australia.

The statement does not deal with the surrounding development or draw any conclusions about the relative contribution of the context to significance, nor does it discuss viewsheds.

Local Heritage Listing

The local heritage list, then called the municipal heritage inventory was completed for the Town of Cottesloe by Dr Dorothy Erickson and Philip Griffiths in 1995. The inventory at that time was



prepared on the basis of a small amount of information. The inventory is a huge task and not much resource is put into each place. Discussions with the council of the day did not go into historic notes, physical descriptions or heritage values. Most discussion was around what should and should not be included in the list. The Inventory was accepted by the Town Council and represents the town's view on local heritage value. The inventory statement of significance reads as follows:

"Overton Lodge" with its landscaped lawns and gardens and splendid views over the ocean would be one of the most imposing and attractive buildings in the state. Has significance for its association with colourful mining magnate Claude de Bernales. Strong landmark features. Has aesthetic, historic and social g (*sid*) significance.

Subsequent to the preparation of the inventory, the heritage assessment and register document was prepared by the Heritage Council. It had the inventory information before it in making the assessment. Ultimately, the Heritage Council's statutory statement of significance did not reflect any value related to the 'splendid views over the ocean'.

The Heritage Council's assessment is the authoritative one.

Conservation Policy

In 1996, Considine and Griffiths Architects (Project 96104) undertook a conservation plan for the *Cottesloe Civic Centre*. The plan was an early conservation plan and does not deal with the setting of the place in its context, other than in relation to its presentation from Broome Street.

Proposals

A) Demolition

All improvements will be demolished on the subject land.

B) Construction

The development application provides for the construction of two levels basement parking, ground floor commercial and car parking level and eight upper floors of apartments and a roof garden.

The design adopts a slender contemporary form presenting its narrowest dimension to Marine Parade and the Civic Centre.

Existing developments in Overton Gardens and Napier Street have had some impact on the view shed from the *Cottesloe Civic Centre* as can be seen in the photomontages that follow.

The series of photomontages are of the existing views from the lower lawn at the *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, and were prepared to indicate what will be seen following completion of the application scheme. With a further series of Photographs in a later section indicating existing site conditions.



Photograph 1: View of Overton Gardens from the Upper Terrace of *Cottesloe Civic Centre*. *Griffiths Architects 2020*.

The proposed development cannot be seen from this vantage point. The development is masked by planting and the existing Overton Gardens development.



Photograph 2: View of Overton Gardens from the highest terrace of *Cottesloe Civic Centre*. *Griffiths Architects 2020*.

The proposed development can barely be seen from this vantage point, other than a sliver to the right.



Photograph 3: View from the upper terrace looking north west. *Griffiths Architects 2020*.
There is little to be seen from this vantage point other than existing developments.



Photograph 4: View from the lower terrace with the Overton Gardens development in the foreground and the proposed development completely obscured. *Griffiths Architects 2020*.



Photograph 5: View from the north end of the lower terrace. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*

There is little impact from this vantage point.

Though there has been some concern about view sheds from the *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, this is not a contributing factor that is picked up by the statement of significance for the place. The preceding photomontages indicate that only incidental views of the proposed development are available from any point from within the *Cottesloe Civic Centre* grounds.

Conversely, no views back to the *Cottesloe Civic Centre* is impacted from Marine Parade along the road axes.



Impacts and Mitigation

In reviewing the Statement of Significance for *Cottesloe Civic Centre*, impacts might be measured.

A review of the values and examination of the possible impacts as follows:

Heritage Values	Potential Impact Analysis	Degree and Intensity of Impacts and Mitigation
The place has great importance to the broad community for its aesthetic characteristics as a well composed set of places in a grand, walled, garden setting and for the aesthetically pleasing character of the whole experience.	The walled setting is visible from Napier Street, Overton Gardens, Warnham Road, de Bernales Walk and Broome Street. The wall can only be glimpsed from Marine Parade along the east west street axes.	There is no impact from the proposed development on this value and no mitigation is required.
The place contributes significantly to Cottesloe due to its strategic location and landmark qualities which make a significant contribution to the townscape of Cottesloe and as a significant component of an important precinct containing several other important heritage places.	The landmark qualities are available as noted above and the heritage places referred to are not adjacent to the proposed development.	There is no impact from the proposed development on this value and no mitigation is required.
The place has importance for its associations with a past lifestyle and its very strong association with its most important and charismatic owner, Claude de Bernales, as a symbol of the second mining boom which saved Western Australia from the severest hardships of the Great Depression when his mines employed a significant number of people. Its associations with the Hon. Mr Justice Pennefather; Laurence Gadsdon, the Mayor of Cottesloe; architects Sir Bernard Evans, Samuel Rosenthal, Harold Boas and John Oldham; and several generations of the Cottesloe Councillors are also of importance.	No impact	No mitigation required
The buildings and grounds demonstrate artistic achievement manifest in the principal characteristics of the Inter-War Spanish Mission style of architecture, with vestiges of the earlier concepts by Pennefather, where the overall aesthetic impact is considerably more important	Most of this value relates to what is experienced within the site and the perimeter walling. There is no impact on this value.	No impact and no mitigation required



than the sum of the individual components.

The place has a high degree of social value and, since its adaptation in 1950 to a civic centre, has continued to fulfil an important social role in the local and State community	The value remains unimpaired by the proposed works	No impact and no mitigation required
--	--	--------------------------------------

The place is a strong presence in the context of Cottesloe and contributes significantly to the community's sense of continuity and place	Applying the same analysis used against the first two values, the same conclusions must be reached.	No impact and no mitigation required
---	---	--------------------------------------

The place is representative of the Inter-War Spanish Mission style and is important in Western Australia for its large-scale use of the style and its comparative scarcity	The proposal lies outside a capacity to impact on the value.	No impact and no mitigation required
--	--	--------------------------------------

The place is representative of a large-scale culturally modified landscape of a type and order that is unusual in Western Australia	The proposal lies outside a capacity to impact on the value.	No impact and no mitigation required
---	--	--------------------------------------

Local Heritage Values

Using the statement of significance from the Local List,

"Overton Lodge" with its landscaped lawns and gardens and splendid views over the ocean would be one of the most imposing and attractive buildings in the state. Has significance for its association with colourful mining magnate Claude de Bernales. Strong landmark features. Has aesthetic, historic and social g (*sic*) significance.

All of these values remain unimpaired by the proposal with the only contentious issue being the ocean views. Since the acquisition of the of the building by the Town of Cottesloe, the land west of the terraces has been subdivided and a variety of buildings have been realised, many of which have impeded a full ocean view. In addition to this, the landscaping of the lower terrace has also reduced ocean views. A number of ocean views will always be protected by virtue of the road reserves so that a number of significant ocean views will be retained permanently. As the study views demonstrate, views form a number of vantage points are not impacted, and at the northern end of the terraces, the impact is marginal.



Conclusion

As this impact statement demonstrates, there are no heritage impacts on State Heritage values arising from the proposed development.

In relation to Local List heritage values, the land west of the terraces has been subdivided and a variety of buildings have been realised, many of which have impeded a full ocean view. Landscaping of the lower terrace has also reduced ocean views. A number of ocean views will always be protected by virtue of the road reserves so that a number of significant ocean views will be retained permanently. As the study views demonstrate, views from a number of vantage points are not impacted, and at the northern end of the terraces, the impact is marginal

The assessment of the development should not turn on heritage matters.



References

Heritage Assessment, *Cottesloe Civic Centre* (Overton Lodge; Cottesloe War Memorial, Town Hall & Civic Centre) (Heritage Place No 0593), Permanent Entry 9 May 1997.

Considine and Griffiths Architects with Erickson and Taylor Historians, *Cottesloe Civic Centre* Conservation Plan, 1996.

Mixed Use Development, development application set, Klopper Davis Architects



Photographs



Photograph 6: Lower lawn north end as existing. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*



Photograph 7: Lower lawn near Overton Gardens as existing. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*



Photograph 8: Lower lawn at Overton Gardens as existing. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*



Photograph 9: Upper terrace near Overton Gardens as existing. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*



Photograph 10: View along Overton Gardens to Civic Centre as existing, indicating existing development. *Griffiths Architects 2020.*